

**World Heritage Site Inscription:
Consultation on Potential Social
and Economic Benefits for
Cumbria**

**Final Report
October 2006**



18 Fisher Street, Carlisle, CA3 8RH
T: 01228 595091 F: 01228 594981 E: carlisle@ers.org.uk

Also in Bristol, Leicester and Newcastle upon Tyne

W. www.ers.org.uk

Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	2
1 INTRODUCTION.....	6
2. APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY TO THE STUDY	9
3. POTENTIAL BENEFITS OF WHS INSCRIPTION.....	14
4. TOURISM RELATED BENEFITS	19
5. OTHER POTENTIAL BENEFITS.....	34
Agriculture and Landscape Benefits	34
Branding of Local Products/ Local Produce	38
Social and Community Benefits	41
Education, Learning and Cultural Aspects	44
Funding and Investment.....	48
Partnership Developments.....	52
Sustainable Transport.....	55
6. ISSUES, CONCERNS AND COSTS OF WHS INSCRIPTION.....	58
7. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	67

Acknowledgement

The study team would like to express their thanks to all those individuals who were consulted as part of this study, those businesses who engaged in the various surveys, and those who attended the WHS workshop. Particular thanks go to the Technical Advisory Group 2 for their support, advice and guidance throughout this study.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

As part of the ongoing work surrounding the nomination process for Lake District World Heritage Site (WHS) Inscription, ERS was commissioned by Technical Advisory Group 2 (TAG 2) to undertake an examination of the social and economic impacts of WHS inscription and to closely tie in the findings with the development of the Lake District National Park's new management plan and visioning exercise.

For this study, ERS consulted a wide range of key stakeholders and businesses, compiled case study evidence from other World Heritage Sites, and assessed the strategic fit of key policies and priorities that influence Cumbria and the Lake District.

Benefits of potential World Heritage Site Inscription

There is a paucity of impact evidence from other sites, due in part to the complexity of relating the causal relationship between inscription and increased activity, and also due to the lack of robust impact studies. However there is reasonable consensus that impacts are distributed between awareness by a wider global audience of the site, international assistance that stems from access to the World Heritage Fund (which is not applicable in the case of the Lake District), and most notably international recognition. This last form of impact has the greatest potential for the Lake District.

Tourism impacts

- World Heritage Site inscription is regarded as a quality mark that distinguishes WHS from other sites and as a consequence serves to attract greater numbers of visitors.
- There is potential for economic benefit to be derived from tourism as a result of WHSI, based on case study evidence that suggests that brands of high national, but modest international, significance will attract an increase in higher spending overseas tourists. Furthermore sites with multiple access points tend also to demonstrate higher overall impact.
- Coupled with a fairly permissive strategic / policy context, there is scope for some optimism regarding the additional tourism benefits that may accrue as a result of inscription.

Agriculture and Landscape Impacts

- Maintaining the physical value of the area includes the rural landscape, the public realm and the built landscape is of critical importance for a World Heritage Site, irrespective of the assets identified in the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value.
- Whilst the evidence suggests that WHS inscription is unlikely to result in further direct support to landscape and environmental stewardship over and above current schemes, it has the potential to result in increased recognition of the economic and cultural role and value of the Lakes landscape in global terms, thus reinforcing the symbiotic relationship between landscape, tourism and sustainable communities in the Lakes. This issue received significant support throughout the consultation process.

Social and Community Impacts

- Overall, whilst there is expected to be social and community benefits of WHS inscription, the evidence seems to suggest that these will primarily be realised through economic and educational benefits.
- Benefits in terms of civic pride and a WHS 'feelgood' factor are wholly contingent on good communications about WHS and the desire of key local stakeholders to fully exploit any marketing and PR opportunities that arise as result of inscription.

Education, Learning and Cultural

- Inscription can improve levels of appreciation, understanding and respect for an area, which in turn may lead to greater support towards the aim of maintaining the value of the WHS. Whilst not tangible, it adds value to the well understood and recognised cultural and educational assets of the Lakes and Cumbria, and inscription will expose these assets globally.
- It is clear that there is the potential for WHS inscription to link to the emerging University 4 Cumbria agenda - the timescales of WHS inscription for the Lake District and the fuller implementation and delivery of the University 4 Cumbria are likely to run in parallel, and there is, as part of this study, an 'in principle' agreement to investigate this further.

Funding & Investment

- Whilst WHS inscription does not bring with it a guarantee of funding, inscription could act as a conduit or add weight and give more strength to applications and requests for all types of funding from a variety of potential sources.
- This relies on local partners using and fully exploiting the status that comes with WHS to add weight to their funding arguments on a case by case basis.

Partnership Developments

- On balance WHSI could build on recent improvements in Lake District specific partnership working that have been noted as a part of this study process.
- The Lake District Economic Futures Study noted the need for a single body to champion the economic future of the Lake District, and there is potential for WHSI to further boost partnership working in supporting the Lake District Management Plan and the Lake District National Park Vision.

Issues and Concerns

The study also identified a number of areas of concern, arising from the consultation process. The main concerns are around:

- Planning and development – and the fears and concerns that WHS inscription could increase planning constraints in the Lake District.
- The negative effects of more tourism – and the need to balance the conservation of the Lake District with any desires to encourage more tourists
- Ensuring that the potential benefits of inscription accrue across Cumbria, not just in the Lake District – and that inscription does not result in a focus on the Lake District to the detriment of other areas, or have a negative impact on other areas
- The planned size of the WHS boundary and the potential use of a buffer zone for the WHS – and the need for clarification of both of these issues
- Connotations of ‘heritage’ – and the impression that having a WHS may give about the Lake District and Cumbria, especially around concerns about preservation ‘in aspic’

Conclusion

WHSI has the potential to add value in terms of impact, but this is in part highly contingent upon the mechanisms by which partners use inscription to develop specific policy and intervention initiatives on a case by case basis. Inscription in itself is no policy panacea to unlock latent potential in the Lake District and Cumbria – the evidence contained in this report suggests it wholly depends on the way the status of inscription is used, furthered and celebrated.

This study has also highlighted the need for **effective communication** of all aspects of inscription, especially around the concerns arising from the consultation process.

Potential Benefit	Likelihood of Realisation
Tourism <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ International (brand) recognition/international awareness of area ▪ Changing visitor spend and visitor profile ▪ Improved/ better visitor facilities (improved 'tourist offer'/ public realm) 	<p>Medium to high</p> <p>Medium to low</p> <p>Medium to high (due to strong policy levers)</p>
Overall Tourism-related benefits	Medium
Agriculture and Landscape	Medium Low (but will add significant weight/support)
Branding of local products/ local produce	Low
Social and Community Benefits	Medium (contingent upon good communication and positive exploitation)
Education Impacts/University links	Medium (dependent on other developments)
Funding and Investment	Medium Low (but will add value to other funding cases)
Partnership Developments	Medium High (contingent on realisation of developing trust between partners)
Sustainable Transport	Medium Low (but will add value to other transport initiatives)

1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 As part of the ongoing work surrounding the nomination process for Lake District World Heritage Site (WHS) Inscription, ERS was commissioned by the Technical Advisory Group 2 (TAG 2) to carry out a consultation study to:

“ undertake an examination of the social and economic impacts of WHS inscription and to closely tie the findings in with the development of the LDNPA’s new management plan and visioning exercise.”

1.2 The study has three distinct components:

- The collation of evidence of interesting and relevant experience where WHS inscription has brought economic benefit and where workable solutions have been arrived at to ensure that inscription has promoted growth and development rather than restrain it
- Consultation with businesses (public, private and not-for-profit sectors) in Cumbria to draw together a set of actions/policy statements/other interventions that those businesses would like to see as part of WHS inscription.
- Consultation with interest groups (public, private and not-for-profit sectors) in Cumbria to draw together a set of actions/policy statements/other interventions that those interest groups would like to see as part of WHS inscription.

1.3 This report presents the findings of all three components of the study, structured around the key issues and potential economic and social benefits that have been identified during the study.

1.4 It is important to emphasise that the focus of this report is on the potential economic and social benefits accruing as a result of WHS inscription. The wider steering group, the project management group and the TAG 1 are leading on the other aspects of nomination process, namely the boundary proposals for a Lake District WHS and the development of the Draft Statement of Outstanding Universal Value for the Lake District WHS.

-
- 1.5 This report is structured as follows: The methodology used and the approach taken to the consultation study is outlined in **Section 2** of this report. This includes discussion (in Annex 1) around the approach of using comparator WHS to identify the economic and social benefits of inscription and the issues with adopting such an approach. It also explains the various means of consultation that have been adopted during the study.
- 1.6 The key sections of the report are **Sections 3, 4 and 5** which provide an analysis and overview of the potential economic and social benefits of WHS inscription that may accrue to the Lake District and to Cumbria. These sections are structured around the main potential economic and social benefits that could accrue to Cumbria and the Lake District as a result of WHS inscription.
- 1.7 Tourism related benefits are detailed in Section 4, and include:
- International (brand) recognition/international awareness of area
 - Changing visitor spend and visitor profile
 - Improved/ better visitor facilities (improved 'tourist offer'/ public realm)
- 1.8 The remaining benefits are detailed in section 5, and include:
- Agriculture and Landscape
 - Branding of local products/ local produce
 - Social and Community Benefits
 - Education Impacts/University links
 - Funding and Investment
 - Partnership Developments
 - Sustainable Transport
- 1.9 Sections 3, 4 and 5 provide extensive coverage of these issues by presenting the results of the review of evidence from other World Heritage Sites, the

findings of all aspects of the consultation process and also by looking at the strategic fit/alignment of these potential benefits with relevant local and regional strategies.

1.10 There are also a number of issues that have been identified in the evidence review and raised in the consultation process about potential concerns and costs of WHS inscription. These issues are examined in section 6, and are as follows:

- Planning and development issues
- Conservation and negative externalities of more tourists
- The need to ensure benefits accrue to wider areas (i.e. rest of Cumbria beyond the Lake District)
- Size of the potential WHS and boundary and buffer zone Issues
- Connotations of 'heritage'

1.11 Section 7 concludes the report by providing a summary of the potential benefits that may accrue as a result of WHS inscription, as well as summarising the issues and potential costs of inscription.

2. APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY TO THE STUDY

2.1 This section provides an overview of the approach and methodology taken for this study into the potential economic and social benefits for Cumbria of World Heritage Site inscription for the Lake District.

2.2 This study comprises of three distinct elements:

- The collation of evidence of interesting and relevant experience where WHS inscription has brought economic benefit and where workable solutions have been arrived at to ensure that inscription has promoted growth and development rather than restrain it
- Consultation with businesses in Cumbria to draw together what those businesses would like to see as part of WHS inscription.
- Consultation with interest groups in Cumbria to draw together what those interest groups would like to see as part of WHS inscription.

2.3 The approach taken to each of these components is discussed below.

Collation of Evidence from other World Heritage Sites

2.4 A key element of this study was to review the Evidence from other World Heritage Sites in order to identify what types, and scales, of benefits had accrued to other sites as a result of WHS inscription. This involved carrying out a desk based review of available documentation on the economic and social benefits of inscription.

2.5 In terms of identifying economic and social benefits of WHS inscription, there is a plethora of documents and literature that make reference to the perceived and aspirational economic and social benefits that may accrue through WHS inscription. One issue that was discussed early on with TAG 2 was the ***difficulties in identifying clear evidence of the actual economic and social benefits of inscription***. This issue is recognised and borne in mind throughout this report.

-
- 2.6 Given the large number of World Heritage Sites across the globe (830 as at July 2006) it was not possible to review in detail the experiences of all other WHS. Instead an approach for selecting a limited number of comparators was developed in conjunction with TAG 2. This approach and the issues surrounding the use of comparators are addressed in Annex 1 of this report.
- 2.7 The choice of comparator areas evolved and developed throughout the study, dependent upon the issues that were arising through the consultations and the evidence review. Eventually, it was agreed with TAG 2 that instead of focusing on a small number of detailed case studies, pragmatic use of comparator WHS areas in relation to particular aspects that were relevant for the Lake District was the most appropriate approach.
- 2.8 However, given the issue about the lack of clear robust independent evidence about the economic and social benefits accruing as a result of WHS inscription, it was agreed that as well as reviewing relevant documentation that telephone consultations with a number of UK WHS would be carried out in order to probe below the surface in terms of some of the perceived benefits and costs of WHS inscription. These telephone consultations (with around 10 UK WHS) were carried out during August and September 2006.
- 2.9 The findings from the case studies are included in Annex 5 to this report.

Consultations with Businesses

- 2.10 The second key element of this study was the consultations with businesses in Cumbria in order to draw together what those businesses would like to see as part of WHS inscription for the Lake District.
- 2.11 The consultation with businesses was achieved using a combination of individual (face to face) meetings with a selection of businesses across Cumbria, a telephone survey with around 150 businesses carried out by ERS, an e-survey of the members of Cumbria Tourism (carried out in collaboration with Cumbria Tourism), and an e-survey carried out with members of the affinity groups of Cumbria Chamber of Commerce and Industry. This combination of techniques ensured good coverage of businesses from a

range of sectors – whilst ensuring that businesses within both tourism- and agriculture-related industries were well represented.

- 2.12 In total replies to the various surveys were received from 171 businesses. From the 171 responses received 143 were from the telephone survey and the remainder came in response to the CTB e-survey and the Chamber e-survey. Ninety-nine businesses were within the Lake District National Park area and sixty-nine were from the rest of Cumbria. Twenty-seven (27) respondents were involved directly in tourism, forty-three (43) were primarily involved in agriculture including thirty-three (33) farmers, whilst forty-one (41) of the respondents were engaged in delivering professional services such as accountants and solicitors. Newsagents, chemists and florists made up at least twenty of the businesses who responded.

Consultations with Interest Groups

- 2.13 The third key element of the study was consultations with interest groups in Cumbria to draw together what those interest groups would like to see as part of WHS inscription.
- 2.14 The ‘interest groups’ consulted included a range of public sector, private sector, community and voluntary sector organisations, authorities and agencies. In total around 45-50 individual (face to face and telephone) consultations were carried out. (A list of all of those involved in the consultation process is provided in Annex 3 to this report.) In addition, e-surveys were also sent to each of the Market Town Initiatives within Cumbria and also to 185 town and parish councils that are members of Cumbria Association of Local Councils (CALC).

Assessment of Strategic Fit

- 2.15 In addition to the above components of the study, a desk based exercise to consider the potential benefits that may accrue in the context of relevant local and regional strategies and action plans was also carried out. The aim was to consider whether the potential benefits identified through the three key elements of the study ‘fitted’ with the priorities and objectives of current

strategies affecting Cumbria and the Lake District. The strategies included in this were:

- Cumbria County Council Corporate Strategy
- Cumbria Cultural Strategy
- Cumbria Destination Management Plan
- Lake District Economic Futures (Stage I and II Reports and NWDA Policy Statement)
- Lake District National Park Management Plan
- Lake District National Park Vision
- Rural Action Zone Next Steps Strategy
- Regional Cultural Strategy
- Regional Economic Strategy
- Regional Spatial Strategy
- Regional Tourism Strategy
- Cumbria Sub Regional Strategy

WHS Workshop

- 2.16 In addition to the above elements, a WHS workshop took place in early October 2006, to which all consultees were invited. The aim was to provide attendees with the opportunity to find out more about the various aspects, and potential implications for Cumbria, of WHS inscription for the Lake District as well as giving them an opportunity to contribute to the ongoing debates. (The agenda, attendees and notes from the workshop are provided in Annex 4 to this report.)

Framework for the analysis of World Heritage Site Benefits

2.17 Based on each of the above elements, the next sections of this report (Section 3, 4 and 5) discuss the main economic and social benefits that may accrue to Cumbria and the Lake District as a result of WHS inscription. The format taken for discussion about each of the potential benefits is as follows:

- ***Evidence from other World Heritage Sites*** – based on the desk review of evidence and the telephone consultations with relevant WHS Comparator areas
- ***Local perspectives on this potential benefit*** – based on the findings from the consultations with (i) businesses and (ii) public, private, community and voluntary sector organisations, authorities and agencies.
- ***Strategic Alignment with Local and Regional Policy*** – based on the review of relevant local and regional strategies to consider the fit between the benefit and relevant strategies.
- ***Summary/Recommendation*** – based on all of the above, a summary note about the likelihood of this benefit being realised within Cumbria as a result of WHS inscription is provided.

3. POTENTIAL BENEFITS OF WHS INSCRIPTION

3.1 This (and the following two) sections of the report look at the potential economic and social benefits that may accrue to Cumbria and the Lake District as a result of WHS inscription. As noted above, these sections are structured around a number of aspects which are discussed for each benefit in turn. These aspects are:

- Evidence from other World Heritage Sites
- Local perspectives on this potential benefit
- Strategic Alignment with Local and Regional Policy
- Summary/Recommendation

3.2 The list of potential benefits that have been identified through the study and that are addressed in sections 3, 4, and 5 are (in no particular order of importance or likelihood of realisation):

- Tourism-related benefits (including International (brand) recognition/international awareness of area), Changing visitor spend and visitor profile and Improved/ better visitor facilities (improved 'tourist offer'/ public realm)
- Agriculture and Landscape
- Branding of local products/ local produce
- Social and Community Benefits
- Education, Learning and Cultural Aspects of WHS
- Funding and Investment
- Partnership Developments
- Sustainable Transport

Issues with Identifying the Benefits of World Heritage Site Inscription

- 3.3 Before discussing the potential economic and social benefits of WHS inscription, it is important to note a number of issues surrounding the identification of the benefits of WHS inscription.
- 3.4 **First**, it is well recognised that the benefits of WHS inscription in general are under-researched. For example, the North American Region's periodic report to UNESCO in December 2004 where an aim was set out to sponsor research into the social and economic benefits of world heritage site status for the benefit of the international heritage community. The issue of there being very little work on the economic impacts or benefits of WHS inscription is also recognised in the ERM (2004) report for NWDA, which also states that this issue is recognised by ICOMOS.
- 3.5 **Second**, much of the research examining the impact of WHS inscription to date has focussed heavily on the resultant effects on visitor numbers and tourism led development. It is widely accepted that if any impact or effects are identified then the primary implications will relate to visitation and the economic benefits that accompany increased tourism.
- 3.6 **Third**, WHS inscription as a catalyst for economic development and regeneration is a relatively new concept (an aspect that was identified by TAG 2 as a key issue). There is recent evidence that WHS are now choosing to focus more attention on the wider social and economic benefits when applying for world heritage status or when developing management plans. However, this is a fairly recent development, and may be linked to the production of Management Plans for WHS which itself is a relatively recent requirement. Many Management Plans are untested – either inscription is quite new, or the management plan has been written recently.
- 3.7 Examples of WHS that include reference to the use of Management Plans to drive forward wider economic development and regeneration include Blaenavon Industrial Landscape, Derwent Valley Mills and Cornwall and West Devon.

-
- 3.8 It appears that such statements referring to WHS inscription as a catalyst for regeneration remains aspirational and its effectiveness as a vehicle for such development still has not been tested rigorously.
- 3.9 **Fourth**, there is the issue of attribution with reference to a number of the potential benefits and impacts of WHS – i.e. it can be difficult to ascertain if a benefit accruing to a site is directly attributable to WHS inscription. Attention to the management process and the activity of partners may be key to each site’s individual successes. There are a number of benefits to WHS areas which it is difficult to clearly ascribe to WHSI. This is a common issue, and relates to the fact that it is almost impossible to identify the counterfactual scenario of what would have happened to an area if it had not been granted WHS inscription. This issue is strengthened due to the lack of evidence and research into the impacts of WHS, and the lack of any need for areas to evaluate the economic and social impact of WHS inscription.
- 3.10 **Fifth**, much of the evidence around the benefits of WHS inscription is regarded as anecdotal and lacking robustness.
- 3.11 However, there are those who recognise the link between WHS and added economic benefits, e.g. in an article on tourism and World Heritage, Lucas (2000) asserted that:

“There is no doubt in my mind that carefully planned sustainable visitor use of a World Heritage Site can play a significant role in its long term conservation, both in making visitors more aware of its qualities and in giving an area an added economic value.”

General Benefits of World Heritage Site Inscription

- 3.12 In general UNESCO describes the benefits as follows:
- **Public awareness.** Inscribing a site for heritage preservation on the World Heritage List can serve as a catalyst to raising awareness for heritage preservation on the part of governments and citizens alike. Heightened awareness, in turn, should lead to greater consideration and a

general rise in the level of protection and conservation afforded to heritage properties. The World Heritage Committee can provide financial assistance and expert advice as support for promotional activities for the preservation of sites as well as for developing educational materials.

- **International assistance.** It is the State Parties' responsibility to provide adequate protection and management for their sites. In this regard, a key benefit of ratification, particularly for developing countries, is access to the World Heritage Fund. Annually, about US\$3 million is made available, mainly to Least Developed Countries and Low Income Countries, to finance technical assistance and training projects, as well as for assistance to States Parties requesting help to prepare their nomination proposals or to develop conservation projects. Emergency assistance may also be made available for urgent action to repair damage caused by human-made or natural disasters. Inscription of a site on the World Heritage List may also open the way for financial assistance from a variety of sources in heritage conservation projects.
- **International recognition.** The overarching benefit of joining the World Heritage Convention is that of belonging to an international community of appreciation and concern for unique, universally significant properties that embody a world of outstanding examples of cultural diversity and natural wealth.

(Source: www.locum-destination.com/pdf/LDR6WorldHeritage.pdf)

3.13 More specifically, there are a number of international examples and perspectives on the benefits of WHS inscription. These include research on Australia's and Canada's World Heritage Sites. As well as these general benefits listed above, there are conservation benefits identified from WHS inscription, such as the cases of Belize and Russia.

3.14 The Russian examples discussed above raise an important, perhaps critical issue, around the conservation versus economic conflicts, with this example highlighting the potential for WHS to be used as a block on industrial and/or economic projects. This issue is given further consideration in Section 6 of this report which looks at the issues and areas of concern around WHSI.

-
- 3.15 There are also a number of potential economic and social benefits identified within Management Plans of UK WHS. Examples include Cornwall and West Devon Mining Landscape, Liverpool, Derwent Valley Mills and Ironbridge.
- 3.16 In summary, the benefits of WHS inscription identified in the above examples all have the potential to accrue to the Lake District if it were to be inscribed as a World Heritage Site. However, it should be noted that these benefits are, in part, drawn from WHS Management Plans and are aspirational, or are drawn from overviews of benefits in other countries. In order to attempt to identify the potential economic and social benefits with more clarity, the next two sections (Sections 4 and 5) consider in more detail the potential opportunities and benefits that may accrue as a result of WHS inscription.
- 3.17 It should be noted that tourism related benefits are presented first (in Section 4). This is primarily due to the fact, as noted at the start of this section, that much of the research examining the impact of WHS inscription to date has focussed heavily on the resultant effects on visitor numbers and tourism led development.

4. TOURISM RELATED BENEFITS

4.1 There are a range of potential tourism impacts that could arise on the back of the Lake District being awarded World Heritage Site Inscription. This section combines the following potential tourism and visitor related impacts:

- International (brand) recognition / international awareness of area
- Visitor spend and visitor profile
- Visitor facilities

4.2 World Heritage Site inscription is regarded as a quality mark that distinguishes WHS from other sites and as a consequence serves to attract greater numbers of visitors. 'Power of the label is useful for the contemporary tourist who seeks qualitatively high standing sites' (Van de Baart, 2005). Collectively world heritage sites have been direct recipients of increased tourist numbers, representing 15-20% of all tourist destinations (Musitelli, 2005), and Van de Baart even suggests that there appears to be a relationship between the numbers of world heritage sites and the number of tourist arrivals per country.

4.3 Many reports have pointed to specific evidence that WHS status increases the popularity of a location or destination with visitors (UNESCO 1995, Great Barrier Reef Authority 1994, Thorsell & Sigaty 2001). However, the causal relationship between inscription and tourism is often difficult to establish.

Increased Tourist Visitation

4.4 The strengthening of UNESCO's World Heritage activity has proceeded against a background of growing international tourism. From 1975 to 2004 figures from the World Tourism Organisation (WTO) show that the number of international tourist arrivals has grown from 222.3 million to 763.4 million (with the first inscription being granted in 1978). However studies have not isolated the impact of WHSI from other drivers that have boosted visitor numbers and that would have occurred irrespective of inscription. As a result studies often refer to perceived change rather than actual change, 'based on what respondents think, not on concrete statistics' (Van de Baart, 2005).

-
- 4.5 Available evidence also suggests that those sites with an already strong global profile (e.g. the pyramids, or the Great Wall of China) appear to benefit little from marketing of the world heritage brand because the intrinsic characteristics of the site are already well regarded. 'Some sites are so well known that it seems obvious for visitors that they are on the world heritage list' (Ratz & Puczo, 1999). This would suggest that sites with a lower global profile might expect greater benefit to accrue from inscription.
- 4.6 Research looking at WHS compared to non listed heritage sites in Australia attempted to assess the impact of inscription on visitor numbers (see Buckley 2004). Despite shortcomings with available statistical data it could be shown that there was a growth in the number of visitors to the WHS, however this growth was associated more readily with the environmental controversy that occurred prior to inscription rather than the date of listing. Conversely however evidence from the U.S. suggests that increased visitation closely correlates with world heritage status. 'During the period 1990-95, visitation to U.S. world heritage parks increased 9.4% as opposed to a 4.2% for all parks' (Galvin, 1997). This difference was attributed to increased international tourism and that world heritage designation made it more likely that foreign visitors with special interests would visit.
- 4.7 Research conducted by Van de Baart 2005, looked at the changes in tourism numbers since inscription using a sample of 86 world heritage sites. 51 of the respondents suggested there had been no increase and of the remainder, 22 said there had been a large increase and 13 a small increase in visitor numbers. The research pointed to the fact that those tourist sites that were already well established destinations in their own right did not register any increase in visitor numbers as a result of world heritage status.
- 4.8 Van de Baart also highlights a clear distinction between domestic and international visitors, with World Heritage Status being more likely to induce an increased number of international visitors. Information from the Grand Canyon National Park (a world heritage site where international visitors constitute 40% of the overall total) reports that 'foreign visitors respond more readily to the world heritage designation than just the 'national park' term'

(Galvin, 1997). **This suggests clear benefit in WHSI positioning LDNP as an 'International Park'.**

- 4.9 World Heritage Sites that are relatively large in scale (those that have multiple points of access and offer a layer of attractions) benefit the most from international tourism as they often serve as 'destinations in their own right' (Van de Baart, 2005). So not only do these sites benefit from high numbers of visitors but also these visitors are more likely to stay within or close to the site boundary for a longer period of time.
- 4.10 Whilst there is a clear lack of quantitative analysis on impact, there is evidence to suggest that sites that have multiple access points accrue more significant benefit from inscription. Furthermore the scale of benefit is thought to be in inverse proportion to the global status of the site in question.

The Economic and Social Impacts of Increased Tourist Visitation

- 4.11 Greater visitor numbers to World Heritage Sites as a consequence of inscription can result in economic benefits, however the resultant effects of increased tourism can sometimes be detrimental.
- 'Tourism-led economic development can be seen to present unique trade offs between promoting the needs of visitors over the local community, and between the maintenance of cultural value and site commodification' (Jones & Munday, 2001).
 - The attraction of a greater number of international visitors brings with it added economic benefits to world heritage sites particularly those that benefit from a 'layer of attractions' (Hall & Piggin, 2002).
 - 'International visitors are likely to stay longer, for more than one day, and are liable to spend more money – especially if they come from rich countries' (Van de Baart, 2005).
- 4.12 Tourism has long been used to generate economic development and regeneration benefits to a local economy, with varying degrees of success. This can involve infrastructure development allowing access to previous underutilised resources, especially in rural, or old industrialised areas. There is evidence that some sites aspire to use world heritage status as a catalyst

for infrastructural development in this way (see Jones and Munday 2001). This does, however, appear to be used more often in those sites using industrial heritage as their unique selling point.

- 4.13 Many examples of world heritage sites using industrial heritage as a catalyst for redevelopment can be found in the UK including Blaenavon, New Lanark, Derwent Valley Mills and Cornwall & West Devon Mining. Whilst infrastructural development in these sites is evident, the role that World Heritage status has played still remains unclear, particularly given that an interest in the tourist development of industrial sites pre-dates world heritage inscription in all cases (Jones & Munday 2001).
- 4.14 The growth in Bed & Breakfast accommodation in and around the New Lanark heritage site is a clear example on the effects of increased tourism. At the time of inscription the area had two 'Bed & Breakfasts', the area now has twenty as well as a 38 bedroom hotel. The infrastructural development in New Lanark however is felt to be only partly attributable to world heritage inscription, 'whilst important, the impact of world heritage status is felt to be subordinate to the other factors affecting the overall volume and type of tourism in Scotland'. (Atlantic Consultants, 2003).
- 4.15 The views of tourism businesses in three world heritage sites in New Zealand cast some light on the role played by inscription on the development of the tourism industry (Hall & Piggin, 2002). World heritage status was not considered to be a reason for beginning operation for the majority of businesses who set up after world heritage designation. Despite this suggestion that world heritage status has had a limited impact it was stated by over three quarters of businesses that world heritage status has had a positive or extremely positive effects on business. A third of all businesses had experienced an increase in client numbers since inscription and it is possible that this figure understates the overall impact as many of the businesses surveyed were unable to quantify the actual impact given a lack of accurate customer data.
- 4.16 Based on the above discussed benefits, but notwithstanding some of the issues and concerns of the true impact of WHS on tourism, examples of the benefits of WHS inscription on tourism are identified in Cornwall and West

Devon Mining Landscape and Bath, with Bath demonstrating that the maintenance of visitor numbers was an important function of World Heritage Status.

- 4.17 In this context, World Heritage status can be regarded as a mechanism for improving competitiveness in the international tourist market. However, it is also interesting to note that the Palace of Westminster does not use WHS status in its promotion as such, although New Lanark, Blaenavon and Derwent Valley Mills heavily use the logo. It could be that the usefulness of World Heritage status as a tool for raising profile can be tailored to the individual needs of the site – an approach best highlighted by Cornwall and West Devon Mining Landscape and Bath.
- 4.18 Whilst there is little evidence demonstrating a direct causal link between WHS inscription and economic development benefit, it is clear that in many cases inscription can lead to an increase in the number of overseas visitors to a site. In the context of WHS for the Lake District, it is important to bear in mind the importance of managing growth and sharing the benefits and impacts of WHS inscription to a wider area – i.e. across the Lake District and throughout the rest of Cumbria.

Using WHS to promote sustainable tourism, education and learning

- 4.19 It is also important to note that in properly harnessing economic benefits of WHS inscription, some WHS have given priority to the development of sustainable tourism and sites have recognised that more visitors are not always beneficial with the potential for issues such as traffic and visitor management to be presented or heightened by any increase in tourism. For example, a review of the Maritime Greenwich Management Plan notes that increased visitor numbers have caused concern for the site's park - *"More visitors means more wear and tear."*
- 4.20 Examples where WHSI has been used to further wider priorities include World Heritage Alliance (and specifically Sian Ka'an in Mexico), Dorset and East Devon Coast (specifically the Durlston World Heritage Gateway Project), Stonehenge and Avebury and also sites in Australia.

-
- 4.21 According to Engelhardt, carefully planned, managed and controlled tourism that services and enhances heritage preservation can be economically profitable if the following objectives are maintained. This includes:
- Use of the country's cultural and natural resources to stimulate the development of a tourism industry which will play a significant role in national economic growth
 - Development of tourism as a tool in the conservation of the country's cultural and natural heritage and the preservation of the complex linkages between culture and environment
 - Enable tourism related to the country's cultural and natural heritage to prosper without damaging that heritage or engendering social problems
 - Development of tourism in a manner that keeps control and operation in the hands of local peoples and allows local peoples to reap the fruits of the business.
- 4.22 Community participation in the planning and implementation of a tourist development plan is essential. When local people are active participants in all of these activities they develop a personal stake in the development of long-term sustainable tourism through the conservation and maintenance of the authentic cultural heritage of their community.
- 4.23 Although Engelhardt's approach appears more relevant to international sites the sentiments on community participation appear to have been echoed in many of the activities relating to UK WHS, for example, Hadrian's Wall and Derwent Valley Mills in particular.

Marketing World Heritage Destinations to International Tourists

- 4.24 As noted above, there is evidence to suggest that WHSI will increase the numbers of international visitors. The international overnight staying market constitutes 5% of overnight stays in Cumbria, and therefore there is scope in increase the number of overseas overnight stays on the back of WHSI.
- 4.25 Existing WHS's have taken a range of approaches in using WHSI as a globally recognised mark of quality. For example in Japan, the Government

actively pursues the creation of tourism destinations which will appeal to prospective foreign visitors, whilst Australia uses world heritage status keenly in promotion of sites. In the case of the latter there was a high degree of scepticism as to the potential benefits of inscription, but this has been reversed due to evidence of increased tourism and economic benefit, with an average visitor expenditure of \$4,000, and 4.93 million visitors in 2000 and some 4.74 million visitors in 2003.

4.26 This suggests that positioning the Lake District as a heritage destination may strengthen its marketing potential. According to the United Nations Environment Programme around 10% of international tourists wish to purchase tours involving natural and cultural heritage sites, and this segment is the fastest growing within the tourism sector overall. For specialist tour operators, visits to high-quality sites that have global recognition can be an important selling point. Research into impacts from WHS inscription on Australian Nation Parks (Buckley 2004) concluded:

- Total visitor numbers at World Heritage Areas are commonly up to an order of magnitude higher than at comparable control sites, both pre-and post-listing.
- For most Australian World Heritage Areas, data are inadequate to determine whether there is a significant World Heritage icon value.
- For the few Australian World Heritage Areas with adequate data to test, World Heritage listing does seem to have a positive effect on measures of tourism expenditure, particularly by increasing the proportion of international visitors quite significantly.

Linking together – Marketing World Heritage Site Inscription

- 4.27 Heritage Trails link several tourism facilities and products located within a geographic area and marketing them in unity has been the essence of the 'heritage trails'. The aims are:
- To design a marketable product;
 - To increase the number of visitors and revenue; to increase synergy effects between the variety of producers;
 - To cut marketing and administrative expenditure; and to ease access to the product.
- 4.28 There is potential in marketing terms to link the Lake District as a future WHS to, for example, Hadrian's Wall and Durham Cathedral as a Heritage Trail. The possible benefits from creating a shared promotion of areas have been discussed in the context of other WHS's, for example, Indonesia.

Visitor Facilities/ Tourism Offer/Public Realm

- 4.29 Visitor profiles may change if the offer to tourists changes. There is evidence that world heritage status has been used to market particular types of special interest holiday, such as gourmet or ecotourism type holidays. There are examples of improvement in terms of what is offered to tourists through enhanced visitor facilities, the development of a better tourist experience through the creation of trails, for example at Hadrian's Wall. Also, in terms of places to stay Greenwich has been singled out as an example of good practice in the way it has gone about improving the quality of accommodation available for visitors. There are also examples of successful transport initiatives.
- 4.30 Individual sites have been successful in building a reputation as a good quality holiday destination – for example the Dorset and East Devon Coast won a 'Tourism for Tomorrow' Destination Award in 2005 as given by the World Travel and Tourism Council, and the New Lanark WHS has also won awards.

-
- 4.31 There are examples of world heritage status being used in promoting areas strong on outdoor pursuits. Outdoor activities are established in the Lake District and align well with the numerous opportunities for outdoor pursuits at existing World Heritage sites, notably The Hadrian's Wall Path, The Rhine Valley Castle Trail and extensive opportunities for cycling tours at the Hungarian World Heritage Sites including Lake Fertő.

Improved visitor facilities at existing UK World Heritage Sites

- 4.32 The creation of new or improved visitor facilities often follows world heritage status inscription. Whilst this improvement is encouraging, like economic impact it is difficult to finitely link the relationship between WHS inscription and improved facilities. Examples of this link include:

- **World Heritage Site Centre at Blaenavon**
- **Derwent Valley Mills** – improvement and upgrades as part of a long term objective to improve the visitor facilities.
- **Dorset and East Devon Coast** - Durlston World Heritage Gateway Project: Plans to restore and further develop this castle as a visitor centre and focal point for the Dorset and East Devon Coast Heritage Site.
- **Giant's Causeway** – the Department of Finance and Personnel is funding a new visitor's centre at a cost of £11.5M, to be completed by 2009.
- **Stonehenge and Avebury**. There are proposals for a new visitor centre and access project at a cost of £67M.

Local perspectives on these potential benefits

- 4.33 There were significant and detailed local perspectives on the issues surrounding the potential tourism-related benefits that may accrue to Cumbria and the Lake District as a result of WHS inscription.
- 4.34 In terms of international (brand) recognition and the international awareness of the area, many respondents expressed an expectation that WHS Inscription would raise awareness of the Lake District and the whole of Cumbria nationally within the UK, but particularly internationally. It was

suggested that more international tour operators may come into the area as a result of inscription and that there could be very positive impacts in terms of international promotion / international awareness.

- 4.35 A notable minority of consultees commented on fact that the Lake District is already a well established national and international brand, and perhaps raised doubts as to the additional advantages that WHS would bring in terms of international profile. However, there is a greater weight of argument around the suggestion that whilst the Lake District is already a very well established national brand, there is a clear potential for the Lake District to enhance its international profile and awareness and recognition of the Lake District through WHS inscription.
- 4.36 Additionally, whilst there is widespread recognition that the Lake District is already a well established *national* brand, there is potential for linkages with other WHS areas (perhaps in the form of heritage trails) that could further enhance the Lake District nationally as well as internationally.
- 4.37 In terms of the potential benefits of WHS inscription in relation to changing visitor spend and visitor profile, it was recognised through the consultations that inscription may help to bring a different type of visitor to the Lake District. Examples provided included the increase of international visitors, who (other things being equal) are likely to have a higher average spend than domestic visitors, as well as particular types of tourists who may be drawn to the Lake District through WHS, with such tourists being described as “higher value and ethically aware tourists” and “lifestyle tourists” and such developments being aligned to ‘sustainable tourism’. The potential for the attraction of such visitors was recognised by a large proportion of respondents to the business surveys.
- 4.38 Overall, the consensus from all consultations seemed to be an appreciation that the need is to have greater visitor spend and a changing profile of visitor rather than an aggregate increase in the number of visitors.
- 4.39 There were some concerns as to the appeal of the Lake District to some of these types of tourists, and whether the quality of all aspects of the tourist offer (visitor facilities, public realm, accommodation and services) is of a sufficient standard to attract such tourists.

- 4.40 The clear potential for WHS inscription to help address some of the aspects around improved visitor facilities, 'tourist offer' and public realm, was recognised in the consultation process, where it was felt that WHS may help to support the development and improvement of these aspects of the area.
- 4.41 A number of consultees noted that some of the current visitor facilities and wider tourist offer are regarded as 'tired' and in need of redevelopment. It was felt that improvements to facilities, the tourism offer and the public realm would not only help to deliver on the first two aspects of the tourism-related benefits, but would also be of benefit to local people living and working in the Lake District and Cumbria. The potential for the improvements to, and the need for investment in, a range of visitor facilities and aspects of the tourist offer was also recognised in the business survey.
- 4.42 Another key issue identified in the consultations was that the 'tourist offer' in the Lake District is the landscape and environment of the Lakes, and therefore that WHS needs to help manage and maintain all aspects of the landscape and environment.

Strategic Alignment with Local and Regional Policy

International (brand) recognition/international awareness

- 4.43 The **Lake District Economic Futures Reports** clearly positions the Lake District as one of the premier tourism brands in the UK and is seen as a high profile outdoor brand. The rest of Cumbria and indeed potentially the North West (and other parts of northern England) can, and do, benefit from the profile accorded to this brand. However, at present the Economic Futures report argues that this role in relation to overseas tourists appears underdeveloped. It suggests the Lake District could be developed as a national and international brand to attract visitors to Cumbria and the region, with the actual visitor experience in travelling to and staying in the Lake District needing to match this image.
- 4.44 There is clear policy alignment in relation to support brand recognition and awareness. The **Destination Management Plan** refers to *maintaining* the vigorous marketing and promotion of Cumbria-The Lake District as a premier destination for visitors through joint activity with public and private sector partners, using an integrated approach and electronic media. Campaigns will aim to retain and grow visitors via brand and thematic-led activity. This is aligned with the RES ('attack brands' and 'signature projects') and the Regional Tourism Strategy at the regional level, and the Cumbria Sub Regional Strategy and RAZ 'Next Steps' Strategy at the Cumbria level.
- 4.45 The **Lake District National Park Vision** has a delivery aim promoting a welcoming National Park to the world as part of the wider regeneration of Cumbria.

Changing the Visitor spend and visitor profile

- 4.46 According to the **Lake District Economic Futures Report** (and NWDA Policy Statement) it is important both for the health of the Lake District and the wider Cumbria (and North West) economy that the Lake District brand continues to perform in the future in terms of the quality of offering in accommodation, catering and townscape terms. There would appear to be an opportunity to widen the geographical catchment of visitors and to increase the number of overseas visitors as a proportion of the total.

-
- 4.47 This is supported by the Cumbria **Destination Management Plan**, which has a key aim to increase visitor spend from £1.1 billion to £1.35 billion in real terms by 2008.

Improved / Better Visitor Facilities

- 4.48 There is a range of strategic and policy levers that support initiatives and interventions designed to improve visitor facilities. In terms of the Lake District there is clear impetus stemming, highlighted in the **Lake District Economic Futures** report, to improve overall quality.
- 4.49 Regarding regional policy, the revised 2006 **Regional Economic Strategy** makes clear reference to the **Lake District Economic Futures Policy Statement** and specifically highlights the need for investment in quality public realm, greenspace and environmental quality. The public realm theme is also highlighted in the **Regional Spatial Strategy**, which also notes the need to integrated range of measures to manage travel demand and encourage a shift from the car to more sustainable modes of transport.
- 4.50 The North West **Regional Tourism Strategy** highlights the need to improve the primary tourism product (which includes National Parks), and the **Regional Cultural Strategy** highlights the promotion of heritage and landscape as central to the culture of the region.
- 4.51 The Lake District represents Priority 4 of the **Cumbria Sub Regional Strategy**. Investment to conserve and enhance the physical and cultural landscape that underpinned the original designation of the National Park is a highlighted as a key priority. This also extends to embrace actions to secure the renaissance of the towns in the National Park and build its image and reputation, as well as a clear signal that continued diversification of the economic is essential.
- 4.52 The sub regional policy impetus for this diversification stems from the rural development agenda that emerged in late 2001 following the Foot and Mouth outbreak of that year, as encompassed in the **Rural Action Zone** First and Next Steps Strategies, and also the North West **Regional Rural Renaissance Strategy**. Objective SO2 specifically refers to the need to renew and strengthen sustainable recreation and tourism, recognizing the

interdependence between tourism and landscape and ensuring that sustainability principles are adhered to.

- 4.53 The Sub Regional Strategy also covers 'high quality' tourism as a Key Priority for employment growth. The Strategy refers to Cumbria Tourist Board (CTB) operating as the Destination Management Organisation (DMO) for Cumbria, concentrating on uplifting and broadening the product in Cumbria to deliver high quality tourism as a key priority in its Destination Management Plan.
- 4.54 Objective 3 of the **Destination Management Plan** involves developing the tourism product in Cumbria to meet the needs and expectations of visitors and the community whilst conserving and enhancing the environment on which tourism depends. This includes the diversity of the National Park itself as well as the coast, market towns, Hadrian's Wall, literary heritage and landscape painting, nature, upland farming and country house hotels.
- 4.55 The **Lake District National Park Vision** contains two outcomes of specific relevance to improving visitor facilities. Outcome 3, contributing to world class visitor experiences, concerns high quality and unique experiences for visitors within a stunning and globally significant landscape and experiences that compete with the best in the international market. Furthermore Outcome 5, seeks to maintain a landscape which provides an irreplaceable source of inspiration, whose benefits to people and wildlife are valued and improved, and whose natural and cultural resources are assets to be managed and used wisely for future generations.
- 4.56 The **Lake District Park Management Plan** contains a number of policies specifically relevant to improved / better visitor facilities, centering on historic environment, Education, Interpretation and Information, Tourism and Transport, which are consistent with potential benefits which may accrue as a result of WHS.

Summary of Tourism Related Benefits

- 4.57 The evidence above suggests that there is potential for economic benefit to be derived from tourism as a result of WHSI. This is based on case study evidence that suggests that brands of high national, but modest international, significance will attract an increase in higher spending overseas tourists.

Furthermore sites with multiple access points tend also to demonstrate higher overall impact.

- 4.58 Coupled with a fairly permissive strategic / policy context, there is scope for some optimism regarding the additional benefits that may accrue as a result of Inscription being awarded.

5. OTHER POTENTIAL BENEFITS

AGRICULTURE AND LANDSCAPE BENEFITS

- 5.1 In terms of the physical landscape, maintaining the physical value of the area includes the rural landscape, the public realm and the built landscape. All of these are issues that are of critical importance for a World Heritage Site, irrespective of the assets identified in the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value.
- 5.2 It is also useful to note that the Department for Culture Media and Sport (DCMS) sees the role of the World Heritage List chiefly to ensure that areas of universal value are maintained.

“The main reason for the establishment the World Heritage List was to prevent the loss of sites of international significance.”

- 5.3 It is likely that WHS inscription can play a supportive part in the maintenance, protection and development of the rural, built and public landscapes of the area. This is an important consideration for Cumbria and the Lake District, as this could allow WHS inscription to be used to help support the role of agriculture in the maintenance and enhancement of the living landscape within the Lake District and Cumbria.

Evidence from other World Heritage Sites

Rural Landscape

- 5.4 Many WHS's have no agricultural aspect at all. Relevant management plans do take farming and landscape into consideration, as seen, for example, in Derwent Valley Mills which show the links between agriculture, landscape and WHS inscription.
- 5.5 The importance of engaging the farming community, the recognition of the level of private ownership, and the resultant key role that private owners had in the implementation and development of the Management Plan for sites such as Hadrian's Wall are important considerations for the Lake District. Other such examples include Giant's Causeway, New Lanark and Stonehenge & Avebury.

-
- 5.6 Notwithstanding these examples, the likelihood of WHS status ensuring landowners receiving additional funds to continue to manage the landscape is a matter of speculation. However, it can be argued that the condition of the landscape is so intrinsic to the area and to the universal value of the WHS that government attention to the role and sustainability of farming in the area may gain greater priority.

The Built Landscape (including public realm)

- 5.7 The regeneration of buildings, the built landscape and public realm have taken place at a number of UK WHS. Whilst it is difficult to ascertain what level of investment for each would have been achieved without obtaining WHS status, a number of sites recognise and are aiming to achieve conservation-led regeneration, including Blaenavon, and Derwent Valley Mills.

The Public Landscape

- 5.8 There are also examples of regeneration and development of the public landscape, with some UK WHS having sought improvements in the public realm, such as Maritime Greenwich, Edinburgh and Blaenavon.
- 5.9 The condition of public toilets, signage and street furniture feature to varying degrees in a number of Management Plans for UK WHS, examples include Bath, Saltaire, Durham, Liverpool, Stonehenge and Derwent Valley Mills.

Local perspectives on agricultural and landscapes benefits

- 5.10 A large proportion of consultees, including the majority of respondents to the business surveys, emphasised their recognition of the importance of the agri-environment and the landscape of the Lake District in general, and therefore, their assumption that this would be one of the key assets of the Lake District WHS. As such, clear emphasis was placed on using WHS inscription to support the maintenance and enhancement of the landscape, with the hope that, given the critical role that the landscape will have in the Lake District

achieving WHS status, WHS will directly or indirectly, provide benefits to, and maintain and enhance the quality of all aspects of the landscape.

- 5.11 A number of different ways in which this could be realised were identified. This included the potential for WHS status to help positively influence the decision making in terms of local investment, where instead of going for the easy or low cost option, the 'quality' option (in terms of ensuring that any investments in landscape are about the enhancement of the landscape and the use of quality materials) will be selected.
- 5.12 It is also anticipated that, notwithstanding the current lack of any guarantee of additional funding with regard to the management of a WHS landscape, inscription could provide some indirect benefits in terms of funding for agriculture and landscape management. This is likely to be in the form of the 'added weight' that WHS inscription provides to the argument for funding, resulting in increased likelihood of receiving additional sources of funding
- 5.13 Whilst, not surprisingly, some (non-farming) consultees noted that the potential for the availability of financial rewards for continuing to manage the area in a way that allows it to be maintained, would result in local farmers being positive about WHS inscription, it is also important to note that farmers are making a living in the area and there are some concerns about further restrictions (from WHS) on the ways in which they manage their livelihood.
- 5.14 However, given the likely importance of farming in the maintenance of the WHS, other consultees suggested that WHS inscription might result in the development of a scheme which gives financial reward for the maintenance of culturally significant farming practices, and that WHS inscription may also unlock opportunities for additional funding for the training of land managers in traditional techniques thus helping to perpetuate the cultural landscape.

Strategic Alignment with Local and Regional Policy

- 5.15 Following the 2001 Foot and Mouth outbreak, there is significant strategic consensus around agriculture and landscape. Whilst much of policy landscape is determined at the EU and national level, local priorities are

encompassed in the **Rural Action Zone** First and Next Steps Strategies, with Objective SO2 specifically refers to the need to renew and strengthen sustainable recreation and tourism, recognizing the interdependence between tourism and landscape and ensuring that sustainability principles are adhered to.

Summary/Recommendation

- 5.16 It is clear that WHS inscription is unlikely to result in further direct support to landscape and environmental stewardship over and above current schemes. However it will result in increased recognition of the economic and cultural role and value of the Lakes landscape in global terms, thus again is reinforcing the symbiotic relationship between landscape, tourism and sustainable communities in the Lakes. The benefit therefore of WHS is to give global recognition to the Lakes landscape and its economic, cultural and community role. WHS will add impetus to the case for environmental stewardship and sustainable farming practices.

BRANDING OF LOCAL PRODUCTS/ LOCAL PRODUCE

Evidence from other World Heritage Sites

- 5.17 One aspect of WHSI that has been the subject of varying levels of development in different WHS relates to the branding of local products and local produce. The marketing of products as being from a WHS has occurred on a number of occasions, including examples within the UK.
- 5.18 It is important to note the official position in that UNESCO gives state parties the right to grant usage of the world heritage emblem:
“Authorization to use the Emblem is inextricably linked to the requirement that the national authorities may exert quality control over the products with which it is associated.
The States Parties to the Convention are the only parties authorized to approve the content (images and text) of any distributed product appearing under the World Heritage Emblem with regard to the sites located in their territories.” (<http://whc.unesco.org/en/114/#principles>)
- 5.19 Experience from elsewhere does suggest that using the World Heritage emblem is likely to be less relevant, or of less benefit, to small sites where local products are few or, of more relevant to Cumbria, where there is already intense competition in the realm of local products/local produce.
- 5.20 One example of the marketing of products as being from a WHS has included the use of an area brand at Hadrian’s Wall denoting ‘Hadrian’s Wall Country’.
- 5.21 Conversely, Derwent Valley Mills has identified branding as a potentially beneficial development but faces a number of obstacles including: a lack of easily identifiable products; difficulty in defining and making available the products; perception that one mill is like any other; issues of using textiles processes and water power; geographic dispersion of the WHS; very low level of awareness about WHS, what it is and its relevance and impact on industrial Britain; the tourism product still being in the developmental stage.
- 5.22 There are other examples of local food and product related promotion, particularly aimed at helping local business, such as New Lanark, Dorset and

East Devon Coast and Derwent Valley Mills. In addition, a number of WHS sell local goods and produce from their gift shops, thereby implicitly branding local produce as being from a WHS.

- 5.23 The linkages between local food produce and WHS has been developed by a number of sites, for example, Val D'Orcia in Italy uses food trails, whilst many other WHS have strong food and drink associations, including the Upper Middle Rhine Valley in Germany, Tokaji in Hungary and Wachau in Austria as well as Porto in Portugal which are all examples of the use of food/drink heritage.

Local perspectives on the potential benefit of branding local produce / products

- 5.24 The use of WHS inscription to develop the branding of local products and local produce was not well recognised in the consultations. It was regarded as an afterthought for many consultees, and is not considered to be a key benefit of WHS. Additionally, a small number of consultees noted that in their opinion it is not considered to be what WHS inscription is, or should be, about.
- 5.25 This finding is not surprising given that there are already good examples of the branding of local products and produce within Cumbria and the Lake District.
- 5.26 Based on the findings of the consultations, this is not a key area of potential benefit from WHS inscription, and the use of WHS inscription for the branding of local products and produce is not a key area of development.

Strategic Alignment with Local and Regional Policy

- 5.27 **The Lake District Economic Futures Stage 1 Report** emphasises the importance to the wider Cumbria economy of the continued future performance of the Lake District brand in terms of quality of offering in accommodation, catering and townscape. There is need to consider how to better capitalise on the niche business opportunities which are located inside the National Park as well as the growth in home based businesses.
- 5.28 The RAZ '**Next Steps**' **Strategy** Objective SO2 (Renew and Strengthen Sustainable Recreation and Tourism) highlights provides a generic framework within which partners can seek to achieve these ambitions while recognizing the interdependence between tourism and landscape and ensuring adherence to sustainability principles through improved rural tourism branding. Further to this, the **LDNP Management Plan** policy T10 refers to supporting the economy and vitality of local communities by encouraging branding of local produce and businesses to use local supplies, skills and services.

Summary/Recommendation

- 5.29 There is little tangible benefit to be derived from, and practically no demand locally with regard to, WHS being used in the branding of local products. However, it is possible that WHS could be used creatively in the correct, niche contexts as a mark of quality for locally branded products. This would require local action and coordination to fully realise.

SOCIAL AND COMMUNITY BENEFITS

5.30 As well as the range of potential economic-related benefits that may accrue as a result of WHS inscription, there are also a number of examples of social and community benefits and impacts.

Evidence from other World Heritage Sites

5.31 **First**, conservation efforts and refurbishment of local buildings can improve civic pride which in some cases can 'lead to a virtuous circle of increased private investment (Atlantic Consultants, 2003). By managing the needs of local communities correctly WHS stand to benefit from the activity of local residents who support the preservation and maintenance of the sites unique features. When residents are able to participate in the preservation of community heritage they can act as a WHS 'natural protectors' (Musitelli 2002) who can help to minimise the risks of detrimental impacts of inscription.

5.32 The ability to effectively engender civic pride is strongly determined by the extent to which residents feel a belonging to the community within the WHS area, which may be more difficult to achieve in WHS which cover larger geographic areas. Examples of inscribed sites that have proactively sought to enhance civic pride include Cornwall and West Devon Mining Landscape and Derwent Valley Mills

5.33 In addition to people living at or near WHS, organisations working to support a WHS can get real pride from WHS status. Sites can use it as a lever to help in preservation, conservation, development and marketing. Kew Gardens is a positive example of a site taking pride in its status.

5.34 **Second**, there are examples of events and activities that are developed specifically for local people as well as visitors – such as Derwent Valley Mills, Maritime Greenwich, and Hadrian's Wall, all of which have developed events and initiatives to enhance involvement.

5.35 **Finally**, there are a range of other community benefits that can build upon WHS inscription. For example, the development of WHS community

websites, which are a feature of some UK WHS, including Hadrian's Wall and Derwent Valley Mills.

Local perspectives on this potential benefit

- 5.36 The potential for WHS to bring social and community benefits to Cumbria and Lake District was an issue well recognised throughout the consultation process, however, rather than identifying additional areas of potential benefit, many consultees linked the social and economic benefits together, and emphasized that if the economic benefits were achieved and managed in the right way, these would result in social and community benefits, particularly in increases in the quality of life for residents, and the potential for WHS to assist in the maintenance of and enhancement of services to rural communities.
- 5.37 The potential for social benefits, such as civic pride to be engendered and further developed as part of WHS was not strong according to a significant proportion of consultees. This is thought to be due to a combination of positive aspects (such as an already high level of civic pride in the WHS area/communities) and less positive aspects, (such as the difficulties of developing increasing civic pride and community benefits over such a large geographic area).

Strategic Alignment with Local and Regional Policy

- 5.38 Regarding social impact, there is policy consensus across all spatial levels of in terms of sustainable communities, social inclusion and well-being. In specific relation to the Lake District, the ***Lake District Economic Futures*** report highlights the role of the National Park in terms of an actual, and potential, source of employment for residents in surrounding towns and villages (as well, of course, as residents of the area itself). However, it identifies the ability to access employment from outside the National Park as a key issue given relatively low wages on offer and relatively poor public transport.
- 5.39 **RAZ Next Steps** seeks to support the social infrastructure of rural areas through maintenance of service infrastructure, addressing particular forms of

exclusion and invigorating support networks (SO8 Social and Community Infrastructure). Furthermore the **LNDP Management Plan** refers to housing needs and planning services that sustains communities and protects or enhances their environmental qualities.

Summary/Recommendation

- 5.40 Overall, whilst there is expected to be social and community benefits of WHS inscription, the evidence seems to suggest that these will be realised through the economic and educational benefits discussed elsewhere in this section of the report. Benefits in terms of civic pride and a WHS ‘feelgood’ factor are wholly contingent on good communications about WHS and the desire of key local stakeholders to fully exploit any marketing and PR opportunities that arise as result of inscription.

EDUCATION, LEARNING AND CULTURAL ASPECTS

Evidence from other World Heritage Sites

- 5.41 Education is an important strand of the world heritage ethos and is one where social and economic impacts are intertwined. WHS status can improve levels of appreciation, understanding and respect for an area, which in turn may lead to greater support towards the aim of maintaining the value of the WHS. Cultural and educational related benefits of WHS inscription are represented at a number of sites.
- 5.42 Upper Middle Rhine Valley is a good example of this approach. The area was recognised for promoting culture exchange between the Mediterranean region and the north for two millennia, for its organic cultural landscape and for being an outstanding example of an evolving traditional way of life and communication.
- 5.43 The use of educational activity is an important activity for many WHS, as it allows the site to widen the appreciation and understanding of the area and its universal value. This has variously meant educational opportunities for the local population and visitors on the value of the site, improved interpretation of a site's universal value through improved visitor facilities, promotion of a site's literary or artistic associations, school trips for activities linking the site with the national curriculum, linking sites with local higher education institutions through the running of heritage and WHS related courses, and more generally by creating a climate for a wide-range of non-academic learning.
- **Bath** has visits by schools focus on specific sites such as the Roman Baths which has a well developed menu of activity for school children
 - **Blenheim Palace** is a resource for a wide variety of education uses, available to any education group, national and international. This includes Pre-school, School and Youth Groups, Colleges and Universities, Language Schools and School Language Exchanges.

- **Derwent Valley Mills** has a well developed education programme and links with the curriculum have been drawn out and built upon through fieldwork opportunities for children from Key Stage 1 to Key Stage 3.
- **Maritime Greenwich** The local university and the Maritime Museum are focal points for learning at this site. Many visitor attractions in Greenwich provide educational facilities, with venues for group visits (including school visits); programmes of courses, seminars and lectures; printed materials and web-based learning resources.
- **Fountains Abbey** provides a wide range of activities for school children, and for non academic educational opportunities.
- **Hadrian's Wall** provides a sophisticated menu for teachers and students on its website giving a wide range of options for educational trips.
- **Kew Gardens** Provides a range of educational opportunities (Learning at Kew) and opportunities include: Kew Diploma (a 3 year Diploma in Horticulture); Higher Education and Training; Adult Education and School Groups
- **New Lanark** has developed a number of educational resources (booklets, teacher's information notes, and resource packs for classroom use as well as books, videos and CD ROMs) to spread knowledge of the site.

5.44 Regarding Higher Education, heritage and other course relevant to WHS-related activities, are obviously not exclusive to universities near UK WHS, but it is apparent that proximity has either been instrumental in the setting up, or in the promotion, of some courses. Universities more geographically distant from WHS often use WHS for study trips and visits, whilst some WHS have universities within their boundaries (e.g. Maritime Greenwich).

5.45 Link ups between universities and WHS are encouraged by UNESCO through a memorandum of understanding between the World Heritage Centre and individual universities. Activity typically includes joint research projects, student or academic staff exchanges, consultancy services, organisation of meetings, and sharing documentation and information. European examples given by UNESCO of world heritage and university links include:

- **Brandenburg** University of Technology (BTU), Cottbus, Germany : Master's Degree, World Heritage Studies
- University College **Dublin**, Centre for Continuing Professional Education, Ireland : Master of Science, Diploma and Higher Diploma in World Heritage Management.

-
- **Moscow State M.V.** Lomonosov University, Moscow, Russian Federation :
Natural and Cultural Heritage Lecture Course
- 5.46 There are also examples of relevant UK courses taught at universities located near WHS areas, including Birmingham University, Bradford University, Bristol University and Kent University. There are also further examples of universities located near to WHS offering relevant courses such as architectural conservation, heritage education and management.
- 5.47 In addition, there is the potential to link universities and WHS through research programmes and research centres. For example, the tenth UNESCO international seminar on Cultural Landscapes was held last year at the *International Centre for Cultural and Heritage Studies (ICCHS) University of Newcastle upon Tyne*. Similarly, Hadrian's Wall WHS Education Initiative is currently the subject of a five-year research study.
- 5.48 In addition to the provision of formal learning opportunities, a number of World Heritage Sites use learning as a key theme in their range of promotional and awareness activities. UK examples include Derwent Valley Mills and Maritime Greenwich.
- 5.49 The Chinese view the WHS, Mt Lushan, as a premier location of learning, so much so that it is classed as a 'learning mountain', building upon its academic history and its ancient traditions as a location for tranquility self-improvement and learning.
- 5.50 Finally, literary themes have also been the focus of aspects of work and development at various world heritage sites. For example Blaenavon has 'booktown' status, whilst Edinburgh is a UNESCO City of Literature.

Local perspectives on this potential benefit

- 5.51 The potential for benefits of WHS to accrue from the links between WHS and education was identified in two key aspects in the consultations. First, the use of WHS to boost the school trip sector for the Lake District – both locally (i.e. by Cumbrian schools which could enhance understanding and appreciation of a local area which has outstanding universal value) and

nationally/internationally by attracting school trips from across the country (and beyond) to visit a site of outstanding universal value.

- 5.52 Second, the potential for links between a WHS and the evolving/developing University 4 Cumbria were also well recognised. Whilst the University 4 Cumbria is still at the development stage, the timescales of WHS inscription for the Lake District and the fuller implementation and delivery of the University 4 Cumbria are likely to run in parallel to a strong extent. This consultation process has already identified that the potential for links with a Lake District WHS in terms of taught degree level and post-graduate courses as well as research activities is something that the University is, in principle, happy to develop further.

Summary/Recommendation

- 5.53 It is clear that there is the potential for WHSI to link to the emerging University 4 Cumbria agenda - the timescales of WHS inscription for the Lake District and the fuller implementation and delivery of the University 4 Cumbria are likely to run in parallel, and there is as part of this study 'in principle' agreement to investigate this further.
- 5.54 Also of relevance to the Lake District's potential world heritage status would be **Lancaster University's Ruskin Library**. A link between the library and world heritage status could be worth exploring.

FUNDING AND INVESTMENT

Evidence from other World Heritage Sites

- 5.55 The potential for funding and investment as a result of WHS inscription is well recognised. The mobilisation of local stakeholders and partners through WHS has led in many cases to the attraction of financial support from a number of different sources particularly at a local and regional level (Van de Baart, 2005).
- 5.56 This attraction of indirect funding is important given the limited funding support available through UNESCO to UK WHS which is often targeted at those sites in that are 'in danger'. In terms of direct funding, sites in the UK do not benefit from the World Heritage Fund, which is reserved for developing countries.
- 5.57 Regarding indirect funding, a good example of local participation and levered funding from local bodies is Dorset and East Devon coast WHS. The management board have noted a change in attitude of funding bodies as a result of WHSI, with both Devon and Dorset County Council having recently donated £300,000.
- 5.58 WHS inscription often leads to regional bodies donating more funding such as the defence line in Amsterdam and the Wouda Pumping Station (Van de Baart, 2005). The Ironbridge Gorge museum also stated that 'world heritage inscription played a significant role in securing funding from the Regional Development Agency (Atlantic Consultants, 2003).
- 5.59 Some WHS have also suggested that it has become easier to source funding from bi-lateral funders, NGO's or national authorities with the UNESCO label serving as confirmation of the global significance of a WHS. This is true of the Galapagos Islands who state that UNESCO label helped them to source funding for preservation projects, 'World Heritage as in the case of most protected areas, increases the associated funding potential of the site' (Castro, cited UNESCO). Sites that have been centrally nominated tend to be the principle beneficiaries of funding support from national authorities as opposed to non-centrally nominated states (see Van de Baart, 2005).

-
- 5.60 This is illustrated in the case of Australia where, 'the level of Commonwealth involvement in the listing process determines the level of Commonwealth support and resourcing of world heritage area management' (Corbett & Lane, 1996). This can on occasions lead to challenges for non-centrally nominated sites in poor regions that have to be more active at sourcing local or regional funds.
- 5.61 There is evidence that successfully securing additional funding, whether it is from localised, national or multi-national sources can directly contribute to wider economic objectives through the delivery of projects or initiatives within or close to the WHS. These projects can be created to pursue preservation or conservation of the area and will therefore result in employment and capacity building opportunities for local people. For example, external funding from the Global Environmental Facility in conjunction with the Mexican government resulted in the delivery of a number of conservation projects in Sian Ka'an (Mexico). In Dorset and East Devon £300,000 of local authority funding supports the appointment of a staff team to carry out conservation activity and to support sustainable tourism initiatives.
- 5.62 Other examples include Maritime Greenwich, and Stonehenge & Avebury.
- 5.63 The role, and importance, of Heritage Lottery Funding to WHS was emphasised by the Minister for Culture in 2005 –*"It is important to emphasise—this has not been mentioned so far—the huge role that the Heritage Lottery Fund plays in supporting our world heritage sites. It has given more than £85 million towards them since 1994."* (Minister for Culture, David Lammy MP)
- 5.64 Heritage Lottery Funding was also deployed in Blaenavon, to create a visitor centre and museum in Torfaen. Other examples of the type of projects funded by Heritage Lottery Funding awards at WHS include:
- **Derwent Valley Mills** – Community Arts Project
 - **Hadrian's Wall** – Marking the Wall – Education and Outreach
 - **Ironbridge** – Volunteering in the Ironbridge World Heritage Site; Stirchley and Brookside South Heritage Trust Trail

-
- **New Lanark** – Education and Access Officer; the Clyde Walkway (Crossford to Rosebank section)
 - **Stonehenge and Avebury** – Abbotsbury Heritage Research Project

5.65 Whilst there are examples of funding being received by WHS areas, a comment on sources of funding at **Saltaire** in their annual report notes that *“Due to the diversity of the sources of finance within the World Heritage Site, it is very difficult to judge how much money is being spent in total on the Site and how much of that is a result of its World Heritage Status.”*

Regional Development Agency Funding

5.66 There are also examples of WHS receiving RDA funding, notably EMDA funding Derwent Valley Mills, and SWRDA and GOSW funding Cornwall and West Devon Landscape. Most notably, NWDA and One North East recently collaborated to joint fund work to promote Hadrian’s Wall.

Local perspectives on this potential benefit

5.67 It is well recognised by almost all consultees that there is no direct funding that will accrue to Cumbria and the Lake District as a result of WHS inscription. However, the potential for funding to be indirectly drawn to the Cumbria and the Lake District as a result of WHS inscription was noted by a range of people consulted as an aspect that is incidental to WHS inscription itself.

5.68 The potential for funding linked to agriculture and the landscape was discussed earlier in this report and is not repeated here, but in general, there is a feeling that WHS inscription could act as a conduit or add weight and give more strength to applications and requests for all types of funding from a variety of potential sources (including those identified above).

5.69 Other areas (in addition to farming) that were identified as areas that could benefit from WHS inscription in terms of an increased likelihood of (indirect) additional funding being made available included conservation management.

Strategic Alignment with Local and Regional Policy

- 5.70 The **Lake District Economic Futures study** recommended investigating a new 'Lakes Environmental Funding stream (potentially managed by and building on the work of the Lake District Tourism and Conservation Partnership), supplementing resources via local fiscal measures to receive support from those businesses who most benefit from the quality of the environment. The **Next Steps Strategy** refers to enhancing inherent wealth generating capacity and employment opportunity, appropriate in scale and nature to local circumstances.

Summary/Recommendation

- 5.71 Based on the available evidence, there are examples of WHS's attracting various sources of funding. However the extent to which this has been contingent upon WHS is unclear.
- 5.72 WHS inscription could act as a conduit or add weight and give more strength to applications and requests for all types of funding from a variety of potential sources. This relies on local partners using and fully exploiting the status that comes with WHS to add weight to their funding arguments on a case by case basis.

PARTNERSHIP DEVELOPMENTS

5.73 There is also strong recognition that the process of applying for WHS inscription can bring a number of process related benefits, especially around improved partnership working between key stakeholders and local communities. This is partly a reflection on the need for effective partnership working to be in place in order for WHS inscription to be successful.

Evidence from other World Heritage Sites

5.74 The participants in the international workshop Cultural Landscapes – the Challenges of Conservation at the occasion of the 30th anniversary of the World Heritage Convention in Ferrara (Italy) concluded that “Cultural landscape management and conservation processes bring people together in caring for their collective identity and heritage, and provide a shared local vision within a global context. Local communities need therefore to be involved in every aspect of the identification, planning and management of the areas, as they are the most effective guardians of the landscape heritage.”

5.75 Typically in the UK, the partners to the WHS Management Plan include: the relevant local authorities, English Heritage, the National Trust, private landowners and farmers, voluntary groups such as “friends of the local area”, the Countryside Agency, the Forestry Commission, local trusts related to the site, regional and local development agencies, national parks, English Nature, and so on.

5.76 This involvement with WHS may prove to be a spur for the partners involved on wider but related issues. For example Tynedale Council, closely associated with Hadrian’s Wall WHS, was designated a beacon council for sustainable tourism in 2004. Other sites noting particular and tangible benefits from inscription on partnerships included Ironbridge and Maritime Greenwich (identified by the government’s Improvement and Development Agency as a site of good practice in relation to its partnership working).

5.77 Another benefit of WHS inscription is around the opportunities for networking that arise as a result of inscription. These can include:

-
- The World Heritage Conference
 - *The World Heritage Information Network (WHIN)* – which is a global network of World Heritage information providers - created in 1995 to foster the exchange of information between partner networks and WHS around the world
 - The Local Authority World Heritage Forum (UK) "*Local Authorities working together for World Heritage*"

5.78 The Local Authority World Heritage Forum (LAWHF) is a network of local authorities in the UK that have the whole or part of an Inscribed World Heritage Site or Tentative Site within their administrative boundaries.

Local perspectives on this potential benefit

5.79 In the context of the Lake District, it is important to recognise the formation and development of the Lake District National Park Partnership and the production of the Vision for the Lake District National Park 2006-2030. Both the development of the partnership itself and the recognition of the four elements of the vision and the fact that they reflect a sustainable development agenda have already been identified by many partners as assisting in the whole WHS inscription process. This 'moving forward' by the Lake District National Park Authority is well recognised (and applauded) by many stakeholders.

5.80 Given that we are still in the early stages of the implementation of the Vision, a number of people did note that they were glad to see the LDNPA 'saying the right things' but were also looking for tangible evidence of actions to support the delivery of the new Vision.

5.81 All of these developments have gone some way to helping to address the divergences in agendas between certain partners (which were mentioned by a large number of consultees) and there is an enthusiasm to remove or minimise the suspicion in order to move forward. In particular, for all partners to be in a position of being committed to, and able to support, a proper management plan to be written by all partners, which should mean a "*living, dynamic future for the Lake District*".

-
- 5.82 It was recognised by a number of consultees that the degree of impact of WHS inscription across all of the potential benefits actually depends on how well partners work together to support and implement it. It was considered that inscription may help this by laying down key criteria, to enable partners to work to the same shared agenda and vision.
- 5.83 One other benefit of WHS in terms of partnership working is that the WHS inscription process engenders longer term thoughts via the development of the Management Plan, and brings with it a responsibility to deliver actions to support the Management Plan, thereby using the WHS process to ensure buy in from all stakeholders to a shared long term vision, bringing with it the responsibility to help deliver the Management Plan. This was noted by a number of consultees who stated that they felt that the *'process surrounding WHSI is as important as the outcome itself'*.

Summary/Recommendation

- 5.84 On balance WHSI could build on recent improvements in Lake District specific partnership working that has been noted as a part of this study process. The Lake District Economic Futures Study noted the need for a single body to champion the economic future of the Lake District, and there is potential for WHSI to reenergise partnership working in supporting the Lake District Management Plan and the Lake District National Park Vision.

SUSTAINABLE TRANSPORT

5.89 The issue of transport, especially sustainable transport, is recognised and developed by a number of WHS through their Management Plans. This is primarily due to the fact that an important factor in improving visitor experience and attracting visitors is a sound transport infrastructure. This has therefore featured prominently in a number of Management Plans. Transport, traffic and visitor management issues also need to be considered in the context of the impact upon transport issues of any potential future increases in tourism.

Evidence from other World Heritage Sites

5.90 A number of UK World Heritage Sites place emphasis on the importance of sustainable transport in their management plans, linking directly to sustainable tourism – notably Cornwall and West Devon Mining Landscape and Giant’s Causeway. Derwent Valley Mills funded a new train, whilst Hadrian’s Wall and Dorset and East Coast both supported new bus services. There has also been a drive to increase cycle tourism at many World Heritage Sites – notably Upper Middle Rhine Valley.

Local perspectives on this potential benefit

5.91 The current situation of transport in the Lake District, and more widely in Cumbria, was raised throughout the consultation process – in particular through the consultations with businesses, where a significant number of businesses noted that they would like to see their business benefit from WHS inscription through improvements in local public transport and roads infrastructure.

5.92 Comments from consultees around transport mentioned the “*need for improvements to public transport*”, but with the recognition that economic “*sustainability of public transport is difficult*”. However, the need to ensure that public transport is more affordable needs to be balanced against the need for economic sustainability of public transport.

-
- 5.93 It was suggested that WHS inscription may help to give more thought to further development of means of sustainable transport. Examples suggested included the piloting of 'no-car' areas in certain places, encouraging visitors to leave their cars outside the 'honey pot' areas and use free buses to access the National Park, whilst others called for affordable and improved parking especially for local people.
- 5.94 The consultation process also raised a number of key concerns about transport links and transport infrastructure at the present time. This included feelings about ease of access – either external access to the Lake District – where trains are regarded as “*unreliable, not convenient, expensive*” or access within Cumbria where public transport provision in Cumbria and the Lake District is regarded by some as (very) poor and expensive. Also, the current struggles to maintain rail links between Windermere and Manchester Airport, and the threats to the Cross country franchise between South West and North West are causing concerns.
- 5.95 Whilst it is recognised that these issues need to be addressed irrespective of WHS, it is thought that WHS inscription may add weight to support the need to address some of these aspects, especially in terms of developing sustainable transport.

Strategic Alignment with Local and Regional Policy

- 5.96 There is a range of policy levers designed to support sustainable transport objectives at a range of spatial levels. Regarding the Lake District specifically, the **Destination Management Plan** refers to developing infrastructure and sustainable transport networks to improve visitor experiences of the region and to bring added community and environmental benefits.
- 5.97 The **LNDP Management Plan** has a range of policies supporting more sustainable transport, and the **Lake District Economic Futures** recommended policy changes to increase proportion of visitors getting around by public transport, including improved public transport infrastructure and encouraging operators to use non car transport.

Summary/Recommendation

- 5.98 WHSI will add weight and impetus to the sustainable transport agenda for the Lake District and Cumbria, and could be used to support particular developments around improved transport infrastructure in the Lake District and across Cumbria.

6. ISSUES, CONCERNS AND COSTS OF WHS INSCRIPTION

6.1 As well as the potential economic and social benefits (outlined in Sections 3, 4 and 5 above) that can accrue as a result of WHS inscription, there are also a number of potential issues, concerns and costs that may arise, or that individuals perceive may arise, through WHS inscription. These issues are to some extent inter-linked, but can be summarised as:

- Planning and Development issues
- Conservation and negative effects of increased tourism
- Ensuring benefits accrue to wider areas (i.e. rest of Cumbria)
- Size and Boundary Issues
- Connotations of 'heritage'

Planning & Development Issues

6.2 One of the key concerns around WHS inscription is the constraints that may be placed on developments and regeneration due to the planning guidance and controls that apply in World Heritage Sites.

6.3 Not surprisingly, this issue is well recognised and as such, a planning statement has been developed by the Lake District National Park Authority. This statement (included in Annex 2 to this report) provides clarity with regard to the issues of planning and WHS, and can be summarized by the statement on page 1 of the Statement which says:

“The Lake District National Park Authority does not believe World Heritage Site Inscription requires any additional planning policy restrictions within the Lake District National Park” (Lake District World Heritage Site Bid, Draft Planning Statement, p.1)

6.4 This statement was reinforced through email communications (21 August 2006) with the UK National Commission for UNESCO which stated that:

“In terms of planning implications, in the UK, World Heritage status does not imply any additional statutory controls. The implementation of the WHS Management Plan relies on the effective co-operation of the stakeholders. Local authorities are encouraged by PPG15 to develop planning policies to protect World Heritage Sites and to consider the importance of the WHS as a ‘key material consideration’ when making planning decisions.”

- 6.5 This statement provides clarity as to the position with regard to planning and WHS in the context of the Lake District. However, given the level of concerns, perceptions, and potentially misperceptions around the planning issues, it is useful to discuss the experiences of other UK WHS, and WHS in general, in relation to planning.

Planning issues and experiences from other WHS

- 6.6 Whilst some people argue that additional planning guidance and regulations in WHS causes a problem in stifling or restraining growth and development, the conservation officer for Bath has recited the opposite problem:

"It is very hard to get environmental issues such as World Heritage status appropriately considered in the face of 'economic necessity', especially when we are talking about emotive (as well as essential) issues such as affordable housing and employment. But, and it's a big but, certainly with Bath and with most if not all other World Heritage Sites, we will be killing the golden goose if we allow inappropriate levels and types of development." (Hansard, 14 December 2005)

- 6.7 A UK example which re-emphasises the lack of additional planning policy resulting from WHS is **Blaenavon** WHS in Wales, which is a 33,000 hectare site, 40% of which overlaps with the Brecon Beacons National Park. There is no supplementary planning guidance relating to the site. According to Torfaen County Borough Council, there is no separate planning policy for the WHS, planning control in the Park is already tight and it has not been felt necessary to add to the present policies.
- 6.8 In addition, there are clear examples of UK WHS which have had significant developments within the WHS boundary – for example, the Scottish

Parliament (within the Edinburgh WHS) and Portcullis House (situated next to the Palace of Westminster).

“Far from erecting a cordon sanitaire around the centre of Edinburgh and retreating within it, its value as a living model of urban and architectural excellence could be, and indeed has been, regarded as a model for new development elsewhere, not just in Scotland but across the world, from the United States to Russia.” (Speech by HRH The Prince Charles, Organisation of World Heritage Cities Conference, Edinburgh, 31st May 2006)

- 6.9 There are also examples of recognition of the potential conflict between WHS inscription and development projects. For example, the Cornwall and West Devon Mining Landscape Management Plan recognises development pressures on its WHS status. Rather than WHS inscription providing UNESCO with powers to interfere and block developments, the lack of sanction available to protect WHS has been advanced as a criticism of World Heritage status. Foster notes that:

“If a global scheme such as the World Heritage List initiative is going to facilitate better management and protection of the planet's unique heritage, natural and built, it must be set up so to do. At a pretty basic level this means adequate funding to enable the necessary management of the assets on the List. This management must be implemented through a well resourced, central administration that can both distribute funds as necessary and offer advice and assistance as required on a site by-site basis.”

- 6.10 According to the operation guidelines of the World Heritage Convention, the state party (UK Government) has a duty to inform UNESCO of ‘major’ developments which may affect a world heritage site, in effect they would be reporting on a site when the management plan had been breached.
- 6.11 A critical consideration with regard to the relationship between planning guidance/ regulations and developments and regeneration within the potential Lake District WHS will be the content of the (yet to be developed) Management Plan.
- 6.12 Not surprisingly, the planning concerns were raised by the vast majority of consultees, especially in the business surveys. There is a wide spectrum of

understanding and appreciation of the planning issues, and it will be vitally important to effectively communicate the planning situation (as outlined in the LDNPA WHS Planning Statement) as soon as possible.

- 6.13 Many consultees and survey respondents raised concerns that WHS may make an already restrictive planning regime even worse, and there was a great deal of support for the LDNPA to publish their planning statement as to how WHS would affect planning policies in the Lake District.
- 6.14 Indeed, some consultees acknowledge that WHS may not result in any tighter planning guidance and policies, they feel that the current situation regarding planning in the Lake District is bad enough that a 'no change due to WHS' does not get a positive reaction. The lack of support from some for WHS may be tangled up in these concerns about the current planning situation and a (mis)perception that planning may get worse if the Lake District received WHS inscription.
- 6.15 Given the above concerns and perceptions, balanced against the clarity of the draft planning statement from the LDNPA, and the experiences of other WHS (notwithstanding some of the current – September 2006 – concerns in Liverpool) it will be important for any future development of the Lake District WHS to clearly and effectively communicate the situation with regard to planning to all interested parties in Cumbria and the Lake District.

Conservation and Negative Effects of Increased Tourism

- 6.16 As discussed earlier in this report (in Section 4 under tourism-related benefits) in some cases the impacts of WHS inscription can result in a number of negative externalities as a consequence of increased visitor numbers. Often this can be in relation to detrimental effects on the retention and preservation of the unique features of the site that were the justification for WHS inscription in the first place. The danger is that tourism and the pursuit of economic benefits are promoted before conservation and that heritage is regarded first of all, as an economic resource. 'The problem is that precedence can be given to commercial and economic activities over core issues of conservation and underlying community sustainability' (Jones and Munday, 2001). Negative impacts of visitor numbers have been reported at a number of sites

including Kakada National Park (Australia), Stonehenge, (UK) and Lascaux Caves (France) (Van de Baart, 2005).

- 6.17 As well as the conflict between environmental conservation and visitors another apparent conflict is that between the visitors and the local communities incumbent to the WHS. Examples of poor management of the balance between 'insiders & outsiders' (Hudson, 1996) are evident at some world heritage sites. The overemphasis on visitor numbers and income generation has led to 'a process of commodification where heritage is arranged solely for the consumer' (Teo & Yeoh, 1997). It can lead to a situation where as well as creating a museum local people become an 'exhibit within it' (Jones & Munday, 2001). By excluding or objectivising local communities in this way part of the unique value of the site can be lost. 'The maintenance of the social context in which they have been inscribed risk being sacrificed to other priorities' (Musitelli, 2005).
- 6.18 The relationship between world heritage status and commodification is unclear. There are examples of instances where inscription is likely to have contributed to the worsening of the problem but also examples of sites that have benefitted from increased support. For example, in the Galapagos Islands (inscribed in 1978) observations suggest that the UNESCO brand has been hijacked by tour operators for commercial purposes leading to the exponential growth of visitors to the site (see Musitelli, 2005). At the same time the global recognition of the UNESCO brand and its values of preservation and conservation have led to many positive outcomes. The prevention of a cable car development at Machu Picchu and the placement of a bauxite treatment factory near an archaeological site in Delphi have are two of the many examples where commercial exploitation of heritage has been avoided thanks to the power of the UNESCO label.
- 6.19 The consultations reinforced some of the issues identified above, with issues being raised about the balance between conservation and the need for sustainable development of the economy, and the desire for a strong tourist economy, which could be strengthened and enhanced through WHS inscription.

-
- 6.20 Some consultees already feel that the Lake District is too busy and that there is environmental damage and pollution from visitors, and that there is a lack of enthusiasm for innovative responses to this from the relevant agencies. However, it was noted by some individuals that WHS inscription could be helpful in improving/ maintaining the environment and addressing such issues.
- 6.21 Others noted that the Lake District is already a very popular tourist destination particularly for outdoor recreation. The high levels of use of the central Fells undoubtedly create difficulties for land managers trying to manage stock and carry out day to day farming activities. As a result there are calls for an assessment of sustainable tourist numbers before the WHS brand is used to attract further visitors to the area.
- 6.22 Finally, a number of survey respondents and consultees welcomed the potential tourism-related benefits of WHS and are keen for further development of this sector to be achieved to help sustain the local economy.

Ensuring benefits accrue to wider areas (i.e. to the Rest of Cumbria)

- 6.23 One of the important issues that has been reinforced during the consultation process as part of this study is the need to ensure that any potential benefits that do accrue as a result of WHS are spread, where possible, throughout Cumbria rather than being restricted to the Lake District.
- 6.24 Other examples exist where the marketing of a specific WHS area is aimed at benefiting the wider area – notably Bath, where links are made to sites outside the city.
- 6.25 The consultations identified that there are concerns from a number of individuals and organisations about ensuring the benefits of WHS accrue to all of Cumbria and not just (parts of) the Lake District. In this regard, achieving this aspiration may help address issues such as improved access to key services in rural communities which was identified as “essential” by a number of respondents. It was suggested that WHS could result in benefits for the rural areas outside of the Lake District presently in decline.

-
- 6.26 Some concerns around this, especially from businesses, linked it to the need to promote all of Cumbria and not just the Lake District in relevant marketing and promotional material. A number of consultees also identified the potential for creating (or exacerbating) a two tier situation as a result of WHS.
- 6.27 It will be important for any next steps in this process, and especially the (potential) development of Management Plan to ensure that these issues are taken on board and addressed.

Size and Boundary Issues

- 6.28 The issues regarding the size of the WHS are all linked to concerns and a call for more information about the boundary (and any potential buffer zone) that will be set as part of the WHS inscription process.
- 6.29 There are concerns from some consultees that the determination of the boundary of the WHS will have an influence on some of the issues and concerns discussed earlier in this report. Questions and issues raised throughout the consultation process include:
- What is the likely boundary for the Lake District WHS?
 - Will different boundary options result in the accrual of different levels of benefits, or a focus of benefits within the core of the WHS to the detriment of the rest of Cumbria?
 - Will the boundary impact upon any planning implications of WHS?
 - Will there be a buffer zone as part of the WHS boundary?
 - If so, where will the buffer zone be?
- 6.30 It will be essential to answer these questions, thereby addressing concerns and providing more clarity around key aspects of WHS inscription. This is especially true if the Lake District WHS goes forward, where clear communication of the planned boundary and clarification about the buffer zone will be vital.
- 6.31 Through providing clarity around these issues, as well as clarity with regards to the planning implications discussed earlier in this section, and also clarity about what the Lake District will be defining as its outstanding universal value,

and by effectively communicating this information to relevant stakeholders, and also in an appropriate format to businesses and the wider community, the result will be a clearer picture in terms of the level of engagement, buy-in and appreciation of the purpose (and benefits) of applying for WHS for the Lake District.

Connotations of Heritage

- 6.32 Through the consultations it was identified that one of the concerns around the inscription of the Lake District as a WHS relates to the connotations of 'heritage'. This also links to the need to communicate what the outstanding universal value of the Lake District is to wider interested parties as this will provide some clarity as to what is defined as 'heritage' in the context of a Lake District WHS.
- 6.33 Some of the concerns identified by a large number of consultees relate to a feeling that that WHS should not mean a '*frozen in time*' or '*preservation in aspic*' state as the Lake District is a living and working environment and this needs to be continued and not negatively impacted upon by WHS.
- 6.34 References to the need to avoid the creation of a 'museum' links back to the issues identified above about conservation without resulting in commodification of the heritage of the area. Many people emphasised that landscape is key to the area and should be key to the WHS, and that this needs to recognise that the landscape has changed significantly through the combination of man and the environment to form such a unique, and universally significant, mix.
- 6.35 Once again, the provision of clarity around what will be contained the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value, and effective communication of the key aspects of this would help to address the concerns that exist around the connotations of heritage in the context of a Lake District WHS.

Summary of Issues and Concerns

- 6.36 The importance of effective and clear communication with regard to a range of issues identified in this section cannot be overestimated especially around:
- Clarification with regard to the Planning implications of WHS

-
- Communication of the Outstanding Universal Value of the Lake District as a WHS
 - The anticipated economic and social benefits of WHS for the Lake District and Cumbria
 - The planned boundary for the Lake District WHS and clarification about the lack of need for a buffer zone

6.37 The process of clarifying and communicating these issues to wider partners was part of the rationale for the WHS Workshop that took place in early October. However, if the Lake District WHS process is to move forward to the next steps, it will be critical that these issues are effectively communicated to all partners and to the wider public in appropriate formats and contexts.

6.38 Many consultees who were not in a position to express their support for WHS for the Lake District have stated that this is primarily due to two issues: (1) not having enough information about WHS to make an informed decision, and (2) fears around the planning implications.

6.39 If both of these issues can be dealt with through an effective communications strategy, it is likely that support for a Lake District WHS would be strengthened across all sectors.

7. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

- 7.1 As part of the ongoing work surrounding the nomination process for Lake District World Heritage Site (WHS) Inscription, ERS was commissioned by Technical Advisory Group 2 (TAG 2) to undertake an examination of the social and economic impacts of WHS inscription and to closely tie in the findings with the development of the Lake District National Park's new management plan and visioning exercise.
- 7.2 For this study, ERS consulted a wide range of key stakeholders and businesses, compiled case study evidence from other World Heritage Sites, and assessed the strategic fit of key policies and priorities that influence Cumbria and the Lake District.

Benefits of potential World Heritage Site Inscription

- 7.3 There is a paucity of impact evidence from other sites, due in part to the complexity of relating the causal relationship between inscription and increased activity, and also due to the lack of robust impact studies. However there is reasonable consensus that impacts are distributed between awareness by a wider global audience of the site, international assistance that stems from access to the World Heritage Fund (which is not applicable in the case of the Lake District), and most notably international recognition. This last form of impact has the greatest potential for the Lake District.

Tourism impacts

- World Heritage Site inscription is regarded as a quality mark that distinguishes WHS from other sites and as a consequence serves to attract greater numbers of visitors.
- There is potential for economic benefit to be derived from tourism as a result of WHSI, based on case study evidence that suggests that brands of high national, but modest international, significance will attract an increase in higher spending overseas tourists. Furthermore sites with multiple access points tend also to demonstrate higher overall impact.

-
- Coupled with a fairly permissive strategic / policy context, there is scope for some optimism regarding the additional tourism benefits that may accrue as a result of inscription.

Agriculture and Landscape Impacts

- Maintaining the physical value of the area includes the rural landscape, the public realm and the built landscape is of critical importance for a World Heritage Site, irrespective of the assets identified in the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value.
- Whilst the evidence suggests that WHS inscription is unlikely to result in further direct support to landscape and environmental stewardship over and above current schemes, it has the potential to result in increased recognition of the economic and cultural role and value of the Lakes landscape in global terms, thus reinforcing the symbiotic relationship between landscape, tourism and sustainable communities in the Lakes. This issue received significant support throughout the consultation process.

Social and Community Impacts

- Overall, whilst there is expected to be social and community benefits of WHS inscription, the evidence seems to suggest that these will primarily be realised through economic and educational benefits.
- Benefits in terms of civic pride and a WHS 'feelgood' factor are wholly contingent on good communications about WHS and the desire of key local stakeholders to fully exploit any marketing and PR opportunities that arise as result of inscription.

Education, Learning and Cultural

- Inscription can improve levels of appreciation, understanding and respect for an area, which in turn may lead to greater support towards the aim of maintaining the value of the WHS. Whilst not tangible, it adds value to the well understood and recognised cultural and educational assets of the Lakes and Cumbria, and inscription will expose these assets globally.
- It is clear that there is the potential for WHS inscription to link to the emerging University 4 Cumbria agenda - the timescales of WHS inscription for the Lake District and the fuller implementation and delivery of the University 4 Cumbria are

likely to run in parallel, and there is, as part of this study, an 'in principle' agreement to investigate this further.

Funding & Investment

- Whilst WHS inscription does not bring with it a guarantee of funding, inscription could act as a conduit or add weight and give more strength to applications and requests for all types of funding from a variety of potential sources.
- This relies on local partners using and fully exploiting the status that comes with WHS to add weight to their funding arguments on a case by case basis.

Partnership Developments

- On balance WHSI could build on recent improvements in Lake District specific partnership working that have been noted as a part of this study process.
- The Lake District Economic Futures Study noted the need for a single body to champion the economic future of the Lake District, and there is potential for WHSI to further boost partnership working in supporting the Lake District Management Plan and the Lake District National Park Vision.

Issues and Concerns

7.4 The study also identified a number of areas of concern, arising from the consultation process. The main concerns are around:

- Planning and development – and the fears and concerns that WHS inscription could increase planning constraints in the Lake District.
- The negative effects of more tourism – and the need to balance the conservation of the Lake District with any desires to encourage more tourists
- Ensuring that the potential benefits of inscription accrue across Cumbria, not just in the Lake District – and that inscription does not result in a focus on the Lake District to the detriment of other areas, or have a negative impact on other areas
- The planned size of the WHS boundary and the potential use of a buffer zone for the WHS – and the need for clarification of both of these issues

-
- Connotations of 'heritage' – and the impression that having a WHS may give about the Lake District and Cumbria, especially around concerns about preservation 'in aspic'

Conclusion

- 7.5 The table below demonstrates that WHSI has the potential to add value in terms of impact, but this is in part highly contingent upon the mechanisms by which partners use inscription to develop specific policy and intervention initiatives on a case by case basis. Inscription in itself is no policy panacea to unlock latent potential in the Lake District and Cumbria – the evidence contained in this report suggests it wholly depends on the way the status of inscription is used, furthered and celebrated.
- 7.6 This study has also highlighted the critical need for **effective communication** of all aspects of inscription, especially around the concerns arising from the consultation process.

Potential Benefit	Likelihood of Realisation
Tourism <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ International (brand) recognition/international awareness of area ▪ Changing visitor spend and visitor profile ▪ Improved/ better visitor facilities (improved 'tourist offer'/ public realm) 	<p>Medium to high</p> <p>Medium to low</p> <p>Medium to high (due to strong policy levers)</p>
Overall Tourism-related benefits	Medium
Agriculture and Landscape	Medium Low (but will add significant weight/support)
Branding of local products/ local produce	Low
Social and Community Benefits	Medium (contingent upon good communication and positive exploitation)
Education Impacts/University links	Medium (dependent on other developments)
Funding and Investment	Medium Low (but will add value to other funding cases)
Partnership Developments	Medium High (contingent on realisation of developing trust between partners)
Sustainable Transport	Medium Low (but will add value to other transport initiatives)